Title: Improving Livelihoods in the Smallholder Dairy Sector in Kenya

Agency Name: Traidcraft Exchange

CSCF No: 0421

Country: Kenya

Local Partner: SITE Enterprise Promotion

Compiled by:
H.G. Muriuki: Team Leader, Dairy Sector Specialist
P. Wanjoji
D.M. Njuguna

Evaluation Period: JULY 2010
Table of contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Table of contents</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acronyms</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Executive summary</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction and background</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Objectives of the End of Project Evaluation</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Methodology and Scope of work</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Results and findings of the project evaluation</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overall impact and achievement</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DTA membership growth and Record keeping</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DTA Self Regulation</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Benefits to groups/associations</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The relevance and benefits of the project</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DTA Gender parity</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Effectiveness</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Efficiency</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sustainability of the DTA branches</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Documentation and dissemination</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unexpected achievement</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Formation and registration of national DTA</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Price harmonization</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Improved market relationship between informal milk traders and regulators</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Traceability</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lessons, Challenges and Recommendations</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusions</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Annex 1: Terms of Reference for the Evaluation: End of Project Evaluation:  
  ‘Improving Livelihoods in the Smallholder Dairy sector’ ILSD project | 23   |
<p>| Annex 2: – Evaluation schedule and Information obtained by the survey  | 27   |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acronyms</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>BDS</td>
<td>Business Development Service Provider</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DTA</td>
<td>Dairy Traders Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ILSD</td>
<td>Improving Livelihoods in the Smallholder Dairy Sector in Kenya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KDB</td>
<td>Kenya Dairy Board</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PH</td>
<td>Public Health</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MoLD</td>
<td>Ministry of Livestock Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TX</td>
<td>Traidcraft Exchange</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SITE</td>
<td>SITE Enterprise Promotion (Implementing partner)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Executive summary

The overall objective of the End of Project Evaluation (EoP) was to assess progress and impact achieved from the ILSD project based on the set goal, purpose and outputs. In order to evaluate the project, a field survey was carried out between 5th and 14th July 2010. The evaluation sampled three regions (Embu, Thika and Nakuru) out of the 10 regions where the ILSD project was implemented. The study gathered information from representative project beneficiaries – the traders, milk bar operators, transporters, regulators (KDB, PH, Local authorities etc), consumers, farmers and the DTA leaders. The ILSD project has achieved a lot including:

- Formation of traders groups at grassroots level – 10 regional branches and the National Dairy Trader Association (DTA) with over 4200 members.
- Increased recognition of informal traders by regulators and other sector stakeholders.
- Improved quality of milk among members as a result of training, and the self regulation.
- Increased incomes and savings for members and greater investments in their businesses.
- Increased access to affordable quality milk by low income consumers.

Some achievements such as indicated below were not planned for (unexpected):

- Formation of a National Umbrella Association, the DTA
- Facilitation of milk market places.
- Milk traceability.
- Financial services to traders. Banks recognize the groups and extend loan facilities. Among the banks mentioned are Equity, Family and Faulu.
- Traders use mobile phone technology to pay farmers (MPESA) and to communicate (especially on quantity to supply)

Relevance of the project

The project targeted small scale raw milk trader’s whose market share of milk sales account for up to 80% of the milk supplied and consumed in the urban and peri-urban areas (SDP, 2005). The old Dairy industry act failed to recognize these players thus creating discriminatory regulatory environment. This had led to harassment by various regulators as they were seen to do unlawful business. The project has been mobilizing them to form groups. The national livestock and the draft dairy industry policies now recognize the role played by the informal milk traders.

Equity

The DTA has made effort to ensure women representation of at least 30% in training and other activities. All DTAs have women elected leaders. The 10 regional DTAs represent the main milk producing areas in Kenya which cuts across different ethnic groups. The inclusion of milk bar operators, mobile traders, milk transporters also brings together clusters of different social-economic status.

Impact

The project has been successful in establishing structures within the raw milk sector which have changed power relations at the local level in favour of the poor small scale milk traders and producers. A significant achievement is the relationship of the branches with local regulatory authorities. Cooperation includes licenses being issued to groups rather than individuals thus reducing costs. At a national level the
Draft Dairy Policy now recognizes the right of the traders previously categorized as informal milk trader. There is a reported increased income and savings for members.

**Effectiveness and efficiency**
The project has been effective in achieving a number of unplanned outputs such as the establishment of a national dairy traders association, assisting milk traders to access credit and improving trust throughout the supply chain. Though there was a reported slow implementation of documentation and dissemination during midterm review, this is now up to date and the SITE team coordinates well with TX staff.
Achievement Rating Scale – Maximum of 5 A4 pages
1 = fully achieved, very few or no shortcomings
2 = largely achieved, despite a few shortcomings
3 = only partially achieved, benefits and shortcomings finely balanced
4 = very limited achievement, extensive shortcomings
5 = not achieved

Achievement Rating Scale

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Overall Assessment</th>
<th>Achievement rating for whole project period</th>
<th>Logframe Indicators</th>
<th>Baseline Values for indicators</th>
<th>Progress against the indicators</th>
<th>Comments on changes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Purpose</strong></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>At a local level</td>
<td>1 and 2. Traders not recognised by decision makers and not represented in decision making Generally, they ‘evaded’ authorities.</td>
<td>1 and 2. The 10 DTAs have been formally recognised and have established communication with KDB and other authorities (e.g. Ministries of Livestock, Health; Police; local council). The DTAs have been included in the KDB regional stakeholder Forums. DTAs also invite regulators to discuss issues affecting them. 3. All of DTA members now report significantly reduced harassment. They receive support from KDB and their Association if authorities try to harass them. More traders are joining the association as a result. 4. and 5. At national level DTA is liaising regularly with KDB. The national DTA is now part of the National Dairy Task Force and has participated in the development of the dairy Master plan</td>
<td>The traders report that now they see future in milk trade business. The traders now make better profits as their products are not confisicated and sell more. At the baseline traders reported losses averaging about 50 litres per week. Currently member of the DTA report reduced losses to about 10 litres a week through spoilage. Groups provide them with credit links and welfare schemes.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>At a national level</td>
<td>4, 5 &amp; 6. The informal sector not represented or organised to articulate views</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Outs</strong>&lt;br&gt;1. Organised and effective DTAs, informed of their rights and responsibilities, and whose collective voice can engage with those that influence, develop and enforce policies and regulations.</td>
<td>1.</td>
<td>10 DTAs with total 2500 members established and operating</td>
<td>1. 10 DTA branches are established and have elected officials. All the DTAs completed organisational development skills training. The training has been cited by members as a key factor in their successful operation. 1. 4200 members currently registered with DTAs. 2. All the 10 organisations completed their training and developed Action Plans (including organisational development and advocacy elements). 3. The DTAs implemented action plans supporting their development.</td>
<td>1.</td>
<td>10 DTAs with total 2500 members established and operating</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1. and argue the case for informal dairy traders with relevant national level decision makers and at appropriate national fora
6. DTAs develop and circulate policy positions and papers amongst policy makers
7. Finalised Dairy Policy accommodates views of DTAs
8. Bill presented to parliament continues to reflect the views of DTAs
9. Act gazetted which reflects the views of DTAs

On policy or their interests.
6. The project supported the DTA to draft letters articulating issues in draft not favourable to them leading to inclusion of traders in draft bill.
7.–8. The bill has been presented in parliament and addresses issues of small scale milk traders.
9. The Bill has not been gazetted.

At national level

More lobbing by the national DTA required so as not to reverse the gains made.

Several stakeholders interests may cripple the traders participation through the standards laws.

The issue of milk carriage containers should be negotiated so that it may go through upgrading stages.

Support by local authorities noted as some groups have been allocated work space to construct a milk market place

The recognition of the DTA identity card has attracted interest from non members who want to join the...
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>regulations</th>
<th>authorities and decision makers</th>
<th>generally evaded authorities by all means possible.</th>
<th>developed during the OD training and developed further follow up plans on various issues which they continue to implement.</th>
<th>4. See Purpose above</th>
<th>Other organization now consider DTA a credible body e.g. NHIF , NSSF now approaching members to join them</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2. Strong linkages established between dairy trader associations, enabling effective collective action at a national level</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1. At least one national meeting/year of trader associations, supported by SITE and TX</td>
<td>No national and/or branch organisations in place</td>
<td>1. The National Association (all 10 associations represented) has met regularly - twice a year since its formation.</td>
<td>The national DTA leaders were recently invited to a regional ESADA workshop.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2. DTAs and SITE develop a clear national level advocacy strategy, supported by TX</td>
<td>Voice of traders unheard in national fora</td>
<td>2. SITE and TX supported the DTA to develop an advocacy and lobbying framework identifying various issues for lobbying. The framework used by the National DTA to engage national level regulators and adapted by the regional DTAs in addressing issues at the local level.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3. Increased dialogue and communication between DTAs and policy makers supported by SITE and TX</td>
<td></td>
<td>3. See Purpose above</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Established and effective self-regulation mechanisms which ensure raw milk traders meet their responsibilities to consumers</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1. Development of appropriate standards and means of regulation by DTAs and SITE, with support from TX.</td>
<td>Regulations and standards set by KDB excluded sale of raw milk—hence did not exist for the businesses of the DTA members. Milk often adulterated by traders and farmers and transportation not always</td>
<td>1. All the DTAs developed a code of practice (standards) as a means of self regulation. The code of practice has been endorsed by PH, LAs and the main regulator KDB. It has greatly improved milk quality for members of the DTAs. Standards include no adulteration of milk and the use of only light coloured containers—these have been ratified for local sales by the respective KDB managers.</td>
<td>Self-regulation mechanisms ensure raw milk traders meet their responsibilities to consumers; there is reported increase of milk sold by DTA members as demand increases. Training in hygienic milk extended by DTA to its members through BDS has now been shared by the traders to farmers.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2. Adherence to standards by members of DTAs</td>
<td></td>
<td>2. The DTAs have identified ways of dealing with non-adherence.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3. Enhanced quality of milk traded by members of DTAs.</td>
<td></td>
<td>3. KDB officials in all the regions have reported that milk quality has improved</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>4. Adoption of standards by</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Reliable access to affordable, hygienic milk by poorer consumers</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1. Licensed, low-cost raw milk available in main markets from members of DTAs</td>
<td>It is estimated that as few as 20% of traders were licensed. Milk often adulterated by traders and farmers and transportation not always hygienic. Low cost milk supply not reliable.</td>
<td>1 and 2. Members of DTAs have recorded at least 30% increase in milk sales. On average milk from milk bars and from bicycle vendors is 25% and up to 50% cheaper respectively than processed milk, and the sales of milk to poor consumers have continued to grow at stable prices. 1. K.D.B is encouraging all traders to join their DTAs 2. Dairy traders account for at least 70% of milk distribution in Kenya. Bicycle vendors sell milk door to door in their communities and the number of milk bars in urban areas has increased significantly e.g. in Kisumu from 10 to 60. 3. see output 3.</td>
<td>Most consumers both retail and wholesale prefer raw milk than pasteurized milk due to price and the belief that pasteurized milk has added chemicals. The standards law still a challenge to traders as it has not been reviewed to allow sale of raw milk in urban centres</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>2. Poor consumers able to buy milk</td>
<td>3. Raw milk meets K.D.B agreed minimum standards of quality</td>
<td>This has improved milk quality. The net effect is confidence with traders which has improved their credit rating and now most farmers prefer them as customers due to their better prices and prompt payment</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Documentation and dissemination of lessons learned on inclusion of informal sector, small-scale traders</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1. Lesson learning compiled by TX and SITE through annual reviews and evaluation</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>1. Participatory Mid-Term Review conducted June 2009 and an end of project evaluation has just been completed highlighting lessons. 2. – 4. A national stakeholder workshop</td>
<td>Some training manuals are important reference materials that can be used for replicability e.g.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
in a legalized market.  

3. National stakeholder workshop  
4. Publications by SITE and TX disseminated through appropriate networks – within the dairy sector and more widely  
   • nationally  
   • internationally  

was conducted to disseminate lessons from the project. Other forums such as the Dairy Task Force have been used to profile the project and the DTA.  

| Activities | Relevance: The project targeted small scale raw milk trader’s whose market share of milk sales account for up to 80% of the milk supplied and consumed in the urban and peri-urban areas. The players were not recognised by the Dairy industry act this faced constant harassment by various regulators as they were seen to do unlawful business. Majority of the small scale traders are poor, buying milk from poor small holder farmers. Through the project thee traders have been organised, have been able to engage decision makers and have had access to various services including licensing and others aimed at improving their businesses. The Livestock policy and the draft dairy industry policy now recognize the role played by the informal milk traders.  

Effectiveness: The activities have delivered the outputs expected under the logframe. It has also achieved some unplanned outputs such as the establishment of a national dairy traders association, assisting milk traders to access credit and improving trust throughout the supply chain.  

Efficiency: The project was completed on schedule and outputs achieved. Resources were to utilized to ensure achievement of the project purpose. |
Introduction and background

Kenya has the most developed smallholder dairy industry in Sub-Sahara Africa with a herd of about 3.5 million head of dairy cattle (2009 census estimates – 3.4 m head), 10 million head of zebu cattle (local breeds – 2009 census estimates – 14 m head), 1 million head of camels (2009 census estimates – 3 m head), about 180,000 head of dairy goats and 14 million meat goats (2009 census estimates – 27.7 m head). Annual milk production from all the dairy animals combined is estimated at about 3 to over 5 billion litres. Dairy cattle produce about 70% of the total while the combined cattle herd contribute over 85% to the total milk production.

About 60% of milk produced in the country is marketed, particularly from the dairy cattle herd (over 1.3 billion litres), and most of it, over 70%, through the unprocessed milk channel. After the liberalization of the dairy industry in 1992 there was an accelerated increase of the informal milk trade (raw milk) in the urban areas even though it was considered as illegal by industry regulators. Part of the reason there was an acceleration of informal milk trade in urban centres was the failure of the formal (processing) sector in satisfying the urban milk demand.

Improving Livelihoods in the Smallholder Dairy Sector in Kenya (ILSD) project is a DfID (CSCF) funded project which run for three years from June 2007 to May 2010 and implemented by SITE Enterprise Promotion, a Kenyan development organization, in partnership with Traidcraft Exchange (TX). It aims to enable traders of raw milk in the Kenyan dairy industry to contribute effectively to the creation of policy and institutional frameworks that are responsive to the needs of the poor and which provide equal access to markets and the right to trade for raw milk traders, and access to affordable, good quality milk for poorer consumers. This will be achieved by the project addressing the following areas: the lack of representation of the small-scale milk traders in policy debates and formulation; lack of organization among traders; lack of established and self-regulation mechanisms in the informal raw milk sector; and lack of equal access to markets for informal milk.

The project’s aim has been to directly target 2,500 small scale raw milk traders and up to 12,500 family members of small scale milk producers selling milk to the traders and low income consumers accessing affordable quality milk. The project also expects milk traders outside the targeted areas and poor consumers of milk in those areas to benefit from the improved policy environment.

The expected results of the project include: small scale raw milk traders organized into effective Dairy trader associations, informed of their responsibilities and whose collective voice can engage with those that influence and enforce policy and regulations; strong linkages established between dairy trader associations, enabling effective collective action at a national level; established and effective self-regulation mechanisms which ensure raw milk traders meet their responsibilities to consumers; reliable access to affordable, hygienic milk by poorer consumers; and documentation
and dissemination of lessons learned on inclusion of informal sector, small-scale traders in a legalized market.

**Objectives of the End of Project Evaluation**

The broad objective of the end of the project evaluation is to evaluate the general impact of the ILSD project on the dairy sub-sector with a focus on the informal milk sector and specifically to:

- Identify the impact of the project and ways that this can be sustained;
- Record the lessons learned;
- Account to local stakeholders and funders for the project’s achievements;
- Improve future project design and management and provide guidance to future CSCF grant-holders;
- An assurance that funds are used effectively and efficiently to deliver results; and
- Enable DFID evaluate the performance of the CSCF as a whole, making sure the overall CSCF project portfolio is contributing to the reduction of poverty and demonstrating, for public accountability purposes, that the fund is an effective use of money.

**Methodology and Scope of work**

A random sample of traders, consumers and farmers was picked from the selected regions, with a bias to small scale milk traders who were the principal target of the ILSD project. From the estimated sample population of 2,500 milk traders, a sample size of at least 93 respondents was needed to give a 95% confidence level. Five checklists (questionnaires) were developed as the tools for gathering information.

The evaluation team sampled three regions – Embu, Thika (Nairobi North DTA) and Nakuru, out of the 10 regions where the ILSD project was implemented. The study gathered information from various categories of project beneficiaries who are the traders, milk bar operators, transporters, regulators (KDB, PH, Local authorities etc) and the consumers, farmers and the DTA leaders in the regions.

Secondary information was obtained by reviewing the following documents:

- Log frame working version
- Midterm evaluation report (Jan, 2010)
- Procedure manual for the dairy traders association,
- DTA – directions for 2010-2012, DTA action plans for the 10 DTA groups
- Capacity building guide for small scale dairy traders association
- Training reports for the DTA traders
- Registration certificates, Constitutions, Training tool kit, Self regulation plans, and Case studies
- Project reports

The evaluation team also met SITE and TX staff. From TX, the team met Edward Wambugu the Regional Director and Rosemary Mbogo the Project Manager while at
SITE the team met Harun Baiya, the Chief Executive, Jane Ndungu the community organization specialist and Judith Kithinji the Business development specialist.

Results and findings of the project evaluation

Overall impact and achievement
During the evaluation, it was reported that before the ILSD project, there was a lot of fear by the traders. A trader was never sure how they would fare in the course of the day. There were also milk losses due to confiscation of the milk and cans as well as pouring of milk by the regulatory bodies leading to great losses and customer dissatisfaction. With the collaboration of the regulatory bodies and the training in milk handling techniques, regulation framework favourable to the operations of traders has been developed. The role of the milk trader is now appreciated and harassment is non-existent as long as they comply with the laid down requirements. The mobile trader thus goes about his business without fear of harassment and fear of loss of milk as used to happen previously.

There has also been increased voice and collective action among the milk traders which is also a major achievement of the project. The recognition of the regional DTAs has led to their involvement in meetings called for stakeholders in their regions. The national DTA officials are regularly invited by the director of KDB for round table discussions with other stakeholders where issues regarding the dairy sector are discussed. The national DTA office is invited to seminars, workshops and programmes that relate to the dairy sector e.g. they were recently participated in the development and launch of the National Dairy Master Plan.

DTA membership growth and Record keeping
During the project period, 10 DTA branches have been established and received certification from the Registrar of Societies in March 2008. These branches carry out democratic elections for their officials (most elections held between November 2008 and June 2010) and hold regular meetings as seen from records. All the officials of the 10 branches have undergone capacity building on group leadership and organizational skills.

The topics covered under capacity building on group leadership include:
- Management of groups
- Provision of services to members
- Advocacy and lobbying
- Business skills
- Conflict management and resolution

A major and notable achievement is in the recruitment of DTA members. The project targeted 2,500 but by the time of evaluation, 4,200 members are currently registered with DTAs. Membership is likely to increase as it has been indicated that more groups have shown interest to join before the end of the year. There has been tremendous growth in the number of groups within the regions visited. In Embu for example, there
were four loose groups before the ILSD project. There were nine groups at the close of the project. This membership of the DTA represents about 15-20% of the traders in Kenya.

Table 1: DTA total membership growth

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Total DTA membership</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Targeted</td>
<td>2500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mid Term Review</td>
<td>1650</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>End of Project Evaluation</td>
<td>4200</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Female</th>
<th>Male</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>End of Project Evaluation</td>
<td>1205</td>
<td>2995</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

![Figure 1: Groups in 10 DTA regions](image)

The following documents are kept at the primary group level and the regional offices:

- Records of minutes
- Attendance register
- Correspondence file
- Bank slip file
- The DTA constitution
- Registration certificate
- Visitors book
- Disciplinary actions register

**DTA Self Regulation**

Working with local regulators – KDB, the District Public Health office, the Police (Officer Commanding Station) and the local council officials (Town Clerk), the District Commissioner’s office, each of the 10 DTA regions has developed by-laws (code of regulation and rules) which have been approved national DTA officials.
It is clear from those interviewed that all the traders are aware of the by-laws. The self regulation has been taken a notch higher in some places to mean more than just group members' conformity. In Embu and Thika, some incidences were reported where DTA traders had made ‘citizen’ arrests of some unscrupulous milk traders, tested the milk and then called the KDB official to make the formal arrest after verifying that the milk was adulterated.

Training
Training on basic milk quality and handling is a pre-requisite of getting license to trade in milk. Training is also essential for capacity building on many aspects including group organisation, leadership, crosscutting issues in the dairy industry, financial and other management skills. The training took place over a three month period with traders attending one day per week. Out of the 4200 members of the DTA, 3020 have been received training under the program. However, the training continued even after completion of the project since it was organised by the TA and paid for by the traders. All the traders interviewed during the survey said they had been trained in the following areas:

- Hygienic milk production and handling
- Milk quality testing
- Milk value addition
- Milk bars –their design and construction
- Record keeping
- Managing a dairy business
- Legal requirements for dairy business
- Customer care and business ethics
- Leadership and management
- Governance and leadership
- Management of association
- Members services
- Self regulation
- Lobbying and advocacy

Those interviewed also pointed out that training had helped them appreciate the need for proper planning. All the groups visited had developed work plans that include checklists of activities, objectives, whose responsibility, time limit, resources to be used and indicators.

Benefits to groups/associations

The relevance and benefits of the project
Majority of the traders confirmed that by working together they have been able to open up business opportunities and links in other regions that were unheard of previously. As an example of this, it was reported that traders from Nairobi were contacted through the DTA and requested to supply milk to Kitengela since there was a shortfall in the region and they had excess milk.

Market information and exchange has been made easier within and across the groups. At the group level, members used to meet irregularly and more specifically when they wanted to pay cess. Currently, all groups meet regularly with most of them meeting once every week. All of them have incorporated some social welfare and savings aspect.
to what was initially a trading group only and this makes it necessary to have regular meetings. Approximately Kshs. 1.42 Million of members’ savings is loaned every week at a repayment rate of 10%. However, not all groups has started the savings schemes at the close of the project. The regular meetings and the social aspects have cemented the groups further and are expected to lead towards more sustainability of the individual groups as well as the DTA.

Other advantages of joining the DTA that were mentioned by members:

- Reduced cost of the licenses since they purchase group licenses for their trade. Traders had been paying Kshs. 1500 per individual for an annual milk movement permit but through the association were able to negotiate with the Kenya Dairy Board for a group permit. Currently groups of about 30 traders pay for one movement permit translating to about Kshs. 50 per trader.
- The training played a major role in recognition by the regulatory bodies.
- Introduction of the DTA members’ identification card and the DTA stickers for the milk bars is a guarantee of quality since all the members adhere strictly to the stipulated code of conduct. They therefore attract more customers and this implies more income.
- The attitude of the consumers to DTA groups and members has changed from that of dirty and unscrupulous traders who deal with unwholesome and adulterated milk to providers of clean milk at affordable price (see table 2 on prices).
- Awareness of the official requirements for milk trade (medical certificate, license, cess payment, etc.)
- Since the DTAs are recognized by the regulators, the members’ attitudes towards the regulators have changed from hostile and people to avoid, to one of advisors and implementers of government policies.
- The group makes it easier to get required documents even at the individual level — the medical certificates were cited as an example.
- Record keeping has improved since the members have to conform to the standards set by the group.
- The group acts as a collective voice to raise issues, air grievances, lobby and also acts as a forum for discussions and enlightenment.
- There are more traders engaged in the business since it is more reliable.
- Group members are recognized as leaders in the milk trading business. As an example of the regard of DTA by other milk traders, an individual who had been in the business for two months approached the evaluation team in Nakuru to know what it takes to be a member of DTA.

According to the regulators in the regions, most of the adulteration of the raw milk in the informal milk trade in the past was the addition of water to increase the volumes and hence income. This is reported to have reduced drastically with the traders themselves testing the milk at the farm gate and rejecting any bad milk. Due to their training, the traders have further advised the farmers against bulking (mixing of morning and afternoon milk) as this would reduce the milk quality or even render the whole consignment bad.
Prior to the project, the farmers were not sure they would see the trader the following day. It was however reported that as a result of the project, trust has developed between the farmers and the traders. Some of the traders were simply unscrupulous (avoiding the previous milk suppliers/farmers) but others defaulted after incurring heavy losses due to several reasons e.g. milk spoilage, pouring and confiscation of the cans by the regulatory bodies, spillage during a chase by regulators, etc. and could therefore not be able to pay. Mobile milk traders now pay good and timely rates with most being paid weekly, or at their choice, instead of the month they would have to wait to be paid by the mainstream processors.

As confirmation of the change of attitude by regulators and the level of confidence to DTA members, KDB officials (the main dairy industry regulators) in the three regions surveyed reported that milk quality has improved among DTA members. They attributed this improvement to DTA demand that members operate ethically and the improved skills to test and transport milk. The officials acknowledged that this has made their work easier, especially when licensing.

**Indirect beneficiaries**

One category of indirect beneficiaries of the initiative have been small scale milk farmer from who the traders buy milk with about 101,000 farmers selling to 4200 traders. Another category has been the poorer milk consumers with volumes sold by traders increasing with about 33% over the project period.

**DTA Gender parity**

Gender imbalance exists in the DTA membership and the office bearers as in many other Kenyan sectors. The imbalance is of concern and a major challenge to DTA. The only region visited where gender parity was almost balanced was Thika (Nairobi North) where the total membership was 342 with 161 being women.

The means of transportation of milk was advanced as the reasons for this gender imbalance. In Embu and Nakuru the main means of milk transportation was motorcycles/bicycles while in Thika the common milk transportation means was public vehicles (matatus).

**Table 2: Membership of the visited DTA associations**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Members</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Male</th>
<th>Female</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Embu</td>
<td>300</td>
<td>238</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thika (Nairobi North)</td>
<td>342</td>
<td>181</td>
<td>161</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nakuru</td>
<td>300</td>
<td>270</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
In a pro-active way, the DTA emphasized the need for women participation in all training programs as a measure of ensuring gender equality in its membership. There was clear effort by DTA to ensure at least 30% of participants in any training program were women. On another front, all the 10 regional DTAs have ensured that women are elected leaders. This effort is also reflected in the national DTA.

**Effectiveness**

The ILSD activities have delivered even beyond the expectation. The project has been effective in achieving a number of unplanned outputs such as the establishment of a national dairy traders association, assisting milk traders to access credit and improving trust throughout the supply chain.

It has also helped to create trust between the government regulators and in particular KDB and the formerly informal milk traders. It has made it easier for KDB to access the traders and in the process generate more income (DTA traders pay cess and other licenses). As a result of training and the use of by-laws by DTA to institute harmony among members, quality of traded milk has improved and there is growing confidence in the quality of milk reaching the consumer from the DTA membership. DTA also creates an opportunity for the regulators to have a forum for realistic engagement with the traders. The DTAs act as one-point- stops for any message the regulators would want to pass.

**Efficiency**

From the response on interviewing the implementing partners it was clear that they have been focused on achieving the outputs of the project and responded flexibly to realities on the ground despite several setbacks during the life of the project. Among the setbacks were:

- Post election violence between February and May 2008 which caused delays in implementation in some regions such as Kisumu, Nakuru, Naivasha and Eldoret
• Major drought that hit the country during the 2008/2009 season causing a major milk shortage; and
• The milk glut caused by over-production due to the off-season rains between the 2009 short rain season and the 2010 long rain season.

The implementing partners have not only achieved the expected outputs with reasonable impact on the livelihood of over 4,000 milk traders and their clients, they have also surpassed the set target within the time schedule.

**Sustainability of the DTA branches**

The establishment and formal registration of the national Association has been a great achievement and the national officials are very positive about the future. They believe this is one way of ensuring their sustainability. DTA recognises the role SITE and TX have played in their development and in their acceptance by KDB and other regulators and they believe they have a bright future. However, they expressed the need for continued support beyond the current project life. This is because it is still very early in their existence as an organisation and has not fully established itself to a comfortable level. It needs some more time to mature and be on its own. All concerned (DTA and the project partners) recognise that significant work needs to be done if DTA is to be able to support the branches and engage effectively with regulators and other key dairy industry stakeholders (relevant Government ministries and other national stakeholders). The national office has developed an advocacy and lobbying framework as well as an action plan for the years 2010 -2012 but needs continued support to see it through.

**Documentation and dissemination**

The Mid Term Review had noted some weakness in the paper trail but significant progress has been made since with the following documents available during this review at SITE offices:

- The approved project proposal document
- Project Log frame
- Annual reports
- Mid Term Review report
- Internal evaluation report of SITE
- Quarterly and annual reports
- Advocacy and lobbying framework for the DTA
- Original baseline studies
- Capacity building guide for small scale dairy traders association
- Case studies
- Training reports
- Checklists for the DTAs
- Organizational Development Plans for the DTAs
- Procedural manual for the DTA
- IEC materials

The project used various platforms to profile the DTA including the Dairy Task Force, various stakeholder forums and at the end of the project held a dissemination workshop attended by all the major development partners in dairy and government agencies. There were also regular consultative meetings between SITE and Traidcraft on the project’s activities and progress.
Unexpected achievement

Formation and registration of national DTA
In September 2008 representatives from the emerging DTAs came together to discuss the common challenges they faced and decided that in order to have a strong voice they should form a national body. Building on a previous constitution\(^1\), a 13 strong national body was elected on 26 February 2009 including one representative from each DTA plus three additional officials. The national DTA received formal registration from the Registrar of Societies in April 2009.

Price harmonization
Although standardization and harmonization of milk prices has not been introduced in all the regions (table 3), there is a move in some places (as noticed in Embu) towards good trading practices where the traders set a minimum farm gate price and a minimum sale price for good quality and hygienic milk (determined by the source distance and road conditions).

Table 3: Average milk prices

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Purchase Price (Kshs)</th>
<th>Sale Price (Kshs)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2010</td>
<td>2009</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Embu</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thika</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nakuru</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Improved market relationship between informal milk traders and regulators
The recognition and orderliness of the groups has led to harmonious working relationship between different milk market players especially between the DTA members and the industry regulators. As a result of the good working relationship it has been possible to develop centralized milk markets (under another project managed by SITE, which supports the traders in the construction of the markets). Though at different stages of implementation (Thika unit has been constructed but not finished at the time of the visit, the Embu unit await the signing of the lease agreement to start construction and in Nakuru, they are yet to identify a plot), the idea of the central milk market has been hailed by both the regulators and the mobile milk traders.

To the traders the centre will:
- Reduce unfair competition by reducing the number of illegal traders
- Offer a central place from which they can look for alternative markets for any excess milk
- Improve standards as all members strive to meet the set standards
- Control the minimum milk purchase and sale prices
- Increase revenue collection as more and more traders join the groups to leap the benefits

---

\(^1\) About 4 years ago a group called the Dairy Traders and Farmers Association emerged. This was a small group of people not linked to, or representative of, local groups. A constitution was developed but very little progress was made.
• Act as meeting place where they can air their grievances or raise any other issues
• In the long run, be the place where the traders can introduce their value added products to the market

To the regulators, the centre:
• Creates a central place to test and certify the milk quality
• Creates a central collection point for government revenue (cess)
• Harmonize the milk standards
• Is a place where all the traders meet and hence can be addressed on any policy issues
• Reduce defaulters (illegal traders)

**Traceability**
Traceability of traded food commodities has globally become important and the Kenya dairy industry has recognised its importance too, particularly for the export market. During the survey it was found out that all DTA members have been requested to list the names, amount, location and identity of milk producers giving them milk. This information will assist in traceability of milk as required by the proposed dairy regulation.

**Lessons, Challenges and Recommendations**
It is noted that although the project donated cabinets for holding DTA groups documents, the physical offices are not there in the areas visited. These items are housed by individual association members and heavily dependent on the goodwill of these members. There is need for groups to have offices where documents can safely be maintained and accessed. Any more assistance may require to be matched with groups’ effort to have an office.

The DTA should embark on a major awareness campaign and funds drive. Currently, despite the ten regional associations and the national body, only the national body has an office. The regional bodies all operate from the offices of the officials and thus depend on their goodwill. The DTA should also be able to provide some facilitation allowance for any member who is called upon to perform an official function due to the loss of business and/or recruitment of a casual labourer when the official is away. At the moment, all the officials carry out their official duties on voluntary basis.

The issue of insisting on the use of the aluminium milk cans as the standard containers for the transportation of milk came up in every fora. Besides the cost (prohibitive to most mobile traders), the traders felt that the cans were too heavy and difficult to balance on the motor bikes and bicycles which were their means of milk transportation. However, use of plastic cans, which have been designed for other uses even if made of food grade material, cannot be a substitute for the recommended milk handling cans.

The main issue and challenge is how to ensure the plastic containers are clean for reuse. Recommendations for reusable milk containers are that the containers are seamless, for ease of cleanliness and the materials used cannot react with milk in any way. The seamlessness (avoiding crevices where dirt and micro-organs can lodge and
be difficult to clean) is the critical issue and there should be effort to develop affordable milk cans of acceptable standards. The government, through KDB and other regulatory bodies should come up with food grade containers that are easy to clean, light to carry and pocket friendly.

The challenge of selling milk in open and unhygienic areas (dusty when dry and muddy when wet) should be a matter of concern and should be addressed (the traders are aware of the problem) through concerted efforts between the traders and the local authorities for the provision of more hygienic environments for the sale of milk.

It appears that despite the training already offered there are areas that continue to need surveillance and continuous training. Two of the survey respondents said that they tasted milk as a form of milk testing. This poses health risks if the milk exposed has already been contaminated with pathogens.

Gender parity needs to be addressed and efforts should be deliberately made to include more women leaders in the group thus joining the DTA leadership. However, the number of women beneficiaries in this kind of project is comparable to that of men.

The concept of the central milk market place for quality control should be assessed with idea of rolling it country wide (similar to the abattoirs through which all meat sold in urban centres has to pass through) but ensure they are workable before rolling them out.

This will not only make the collection of government revenue easier but will also ensure that the minimum milk standards are met. It will also make traceability of the milk traded in the informal sector a reality.

A key area that needs more attention and emphasis is the dissemination of lessons learned and sharing of skills and experiences across the DTAs

**Conclusions**

All in all, measured against what the project aimed at achieving and on the project’s goals i.e. increased recognition and greater inclusion of the informal sector in Kenyan national policy; and increased income of informal traders and number of licensed traders, the ILSD project has been a resounding success. The main objective (purpose) of enabling raw milk traders in the Kenyan dairy industry to effectively contribute to the creation of policy and institutional frameworks that are responsive to their needs and the needs of the poor has also been achieved to some degree considering the level of the DTA participation in policy level and other national forums on dairy industry. There is however need to include some training on policy particularly on understanding what constitutes policy, policy formulation and how to lobby for policy change if need be.

As already observed, the quality of the traded milk still faces the challenge of container cleaning. Major strides have been made in this regard with the regions visited having banned the use of black containers and introduced yellow and white containers for
transportation of milk. Their next step is a move towards better food grade containers which will not hide any dirt and thus will improve the milk quality towards the desired standards.

Training should be an on-going (new members) and evolving (re-training on emerging issues) exercise and should not be for the projects or left to the DTA but should be spearheaded by KDB (although they offer training, perhaps they need adequate budget for better coverage) in collaboration with other regulatory bodies e.g. Public health, Local authorities, KEBS, etc.

Background
The ILSD project is a partnership between Traidcraft Exchange and SITE who are the project implementing partner, and is funded through the DFID Civil Society Challenge Fund [CSCF]. The project aims to enable traders of raw milk in the Kenyan dairy industry to contribute effectively to the creation of policy and institutional frameworks that are responsive to the needs of the poor. These frameworks should provide equal access to markets and the right to trade for raw milk traders, and access to affordable, good quality milk for poorer consumers. Learning from the project is intended to contribute to the wider goal of ensuring that the informal sector, small traders and producers enjoy their right to a dignified livelihood through inclusion in legalized markets.

The issues addressed by the project include;

- The lack of representation of the small-scale milk traders in policy debates and formulation. The small scale sector has continued to be regulated under an old Dairy Industry Act whose amendment has not factored in the small sector thus creating discriminatory regulatory environment.
- Lack of organization among traders in order to empower them to lobby for the rights of the traders at local and national level.
- Lack of established and self-regulation mechanisms in the informal raw milk sector to create reliable access to affordable, hygienic milk by poorer consumers.
- The lack of equal access to markets for informal milk traders mainly due to a negative business environment where informal milk traders are harassed by authorities resulting in consumers with low incomes denied access to affordable good quality milk.

The project aims to directly target 2,500 small scale raw milk traders and up to 12,500 family members, small scale milk producers selling milk to the traders and low income consumers accessing affordable quality milk. It also indirectly targets milk traders outside the targeted areas who benefit from the improved policy environment and poor consumers of milk in those areas.

The expected results of the project are;

- Small scale raw milk traders organized into effective Dairy trader associations, informed of their responsibilities and whose collective voice can engage with those that influence and enforce policy and regulations.
- Strong linkages established between dairy trader associations, enabling effective collective action at a national level.
- Established and effective self-regulation mechanisms which ensure raw milk traders meet their responsibilities to consumers.
- Reliable access to affordable, hygienic milk by poor consumers.
- Documentation and dissemination of lessons learned on inclusion of informal sector, small-scale traders in a legalized market.
Purpose
The End of Project Evaluation aims to:
• Identify the impact of the project and ways that this can be sustained.
• Record the lessons learned.
• Account to local stakeholders and funders for the project’s achievements.
• Continuously improve project design and management and the guidance available to future CSCF grant-holders.
• Ensure that funds are used effectively and efficiently to deliver results.
• Enable DFID to monitor and evaluate the performance of the CSCF as a whole, making sure the overall CSCF project portfolio is contributing to the reduction of poverty and demonstrating, for public accountability purposes, that the fund is an effective use of money.

Objective and scope of work

The overall objective of the evaluation is to assess what has been achieved vis-à-vis the overall project goal, purpose and outputs.

Specifically the consultant will be required to:
• Assess achievements realised against indicators as detailed in the project logframe.
• Identify and determine any unexpected achievements realised but not captured through reporting against indicators specifies in the logframe.
• Making reference to the log frame, review project activities undertaken during the implementation of the project, and make comments on their relevance, efficiency and effectiveness with regards to achieving project outputs.
• Review the activities undertaken during the project and comment on issues of equity, sustainability and replicability.
• Make recommendations for improvements for similar actions based on observations during the evaluation process.

Methodology

The consultant will:

• Conduct a desk review of project information including the key documents listed in these terms of reference- See Annex B.
• Meet with the project partners (Traidcraft and SITE) to discuss the overall evaluation methodology and the key issues to be addressed. Further, the logistics/reporting, coverage of the evaluation (including sampling) logistics, tools and timelines will be agreed upon during this meeting.
• Design and agree the evaluation detailed methodology including process, tools and reporting templates.
• Determine the sample type, size and distribution of the target respondents, clearly justifying why the sample is representative of the overall project target groups. The sample size must be adequate and representative to ensure that any trends and patterns developed during the duration of the project are observed and verifiable.
• Conduct interviews with the project implementation team and partners to collect information on achievements and impact and difficulties faced by the project including managerial aspects of the work.
• Conduct interviews with key project stakeholders.
• Undertake field research covering the primary beneficiaries and other key stakeholders in the respective project areas.
• Make a preliminary presentation of the findings to the project partners in Kenya to receive comments before preparing the final evaluation report.

During the evaluation, participatory approaches should as far as possible be used with the respondents. Further, the consultant will satisfy themselves that any information gathered through desk and field research is verified as accurate and from a reliable source. The consultant will also ensure that the information is relevant, in the right context and is applicable to the project.

**Key outputs and report outline**

The evaluator will produce a report (no more than 30 pages plus appendices, in MS word using Arial font 12). The report shall include:

a) Basic information (1 A4 page maximum) – See content
b) Executive Summary (1 A4 page maximum)
c) Achievement Ration Scale (5 pages maximum-see template at Annex A).
d) Main evaluation report. The section will cover methodology used, key finding and results-specifically in reference to the logframe where appropriate discussing relevance, equity, efficiency, effectiveness, impact, sustainability, replicability, information dissemination and lessons learned. The report will capture conclusions and recommendations as well.
e) Annexes; This will include materials which to the evaluator, adds value to the report, and also will include list of interviewees/respondents, the TORs, itinerary etc.

The Consultant will submit an electronic format [in Microsoft word] of the final report in written English.

**Required expertise:** The expertise of the lead evaluator envisaged includes a thorough and practical knowledge of the dairy sector in Kenya, specifically in aspects of policy/regulatory environment and markets, both the formal and informal milk market. It is expected that the evaluator will have worked in this sector for a period of not less than 7 years continuously. The evaluator will have proven experience in the design and management of similar projects. Past evaluation or management of DFID supported projects will be an advantage. The lead evaluator may team with a junior team member who has proficient expertise in social economic studies especially among small scale traders (work with dairy sector – farmer or trader level) to assist with information gathering.

**Reporting and responsibilities:** Traidcraft Regional Office is responsible for the evaluation process and results. Thus the consultant will report to Traidcraft. SITE is responsible for planning the logistics and organizing interviews and meetings as and where appropriate, and availing to the consultants all the relevant documents required for the exercise. (Documents are listed on Annex B)
Proposed time frame

It is expected that the evaluation will be conducted over a 3 week period with an estimated effort of 21 person days. The final report must be submitted by end of June 2010. Other timings e.g. field trips; draft report presentation etc. will be discussed and agreed upon by the consultant and the partners.

ANNEX B

Documents/information to be shared with the consultants

- The approved project proposal documents.
- The original project logframe and any subsequent amended logframes with the rationale for the changes.
- Annual Project Reports, including financial information.
- Any case studies submitted to DFID.
- Any examples of lessons shared during the lifetime of the Project.
- Original baseline studies and any subsequent studies to show impact.
- Other evidence of impact that the project team thinks is important. This could include anecdotes of decisions having been taken, policies or programmes that have changed or communication material that may have an impact on decision-making.

Declaration from the Evaluator

I Hezekiah Muriuki do declare that my team and I conducted the End of Project Evaluation for the ILSD project, with complete independence from the project team.

Hezekiah G. Muriuki

My other team members were Patrick Wanjohi and Daniel Njuguna
Annex 2: – Evaluation schedule and Information obtained by the survey

Evaluation schedule

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Activity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1-2/7/2010</td>
<td>Literature review in SITEs office</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4/7/20210</td>
<td>Travel to Embu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5/7/2010</td>
<td>Conduct interviews in Embu – whole day</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6/7/2010</td>
<td>Conduct interviews in Thika – whole day</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7/7/2010</td>
<td>Morning - Travel to Nakuru</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mid morning and afternoon - Interviews</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8/7/2020</td>
<td>Morning - Interviews in Nakuru</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Afternoon - travel back to Nairobi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9/7/2010</td>
<td>Morning - Interviews with the National DTA in Nairobi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12/7/2010 – 23/7/2010</td>
<td>Data analysis and Report writing by evaluation team</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24/7/2010</td>
<td>Draft report presentation to TX, SITE and DTA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28/7/2010</td>
<td>Final report presented by evaluator</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Traders interviewed summary (figures in brackets indicate females)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Group</th>
<th>Embu</th>
<th>Thika</th>
<th>Nakuru</th>
<th>totals</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Milk Traders</td>
<td>8(1)</td>
<td>7(3)</td>
<td>10(1)</td>
<td>25 (5)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consumers</td>
<td>4(2)</td>
<td>2(0)</td>
<td>5(1)</td>
<td>11 (3)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Producers</td>
<td>1(0)</td>
<td>5(2)</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>6 (2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Plenary</td>
<td>22(4)</td>
<td>20(9)</td>
<td>25(0)</td>
<td>67 (13)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>men total</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>23 women , 86 men</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Average milk prices

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Purchase Price (Kshs)</th>
<th>Sale Price (Kshs)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2010</td>
<td>2009</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Embu</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thika</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nakuru</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Annex 3: Documents Reviewed

The following documents were availed by SITE for review by the evaluation team:
- The approved project proposal document
- Project Log frame
- Mid Term Review report
- Internal evaluation report by SITE
- Quarterly and annual reports
- Original baseline studies
- Advocacy and lobbying framework for the DTA
- Capacity building guide for small scale dairy traders association
- Case studies
- Training reports
- Organizational Development Plans for the DTAs
- Procedural manual for the DTA
- Various IEC materials

The following documents were available for review from the DTA:
1. Registration certificates
2. Constitutions
3. Register of members
4. Meeting minutes
5. Action plans
6. Advocacy plans
7. Training reports
8. Checklists of activities
10. Case studies
11. Procedures manual
12. IEC materials
13. Project reports